

Governing Body Addendum

Modernising Health and Care Services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish Area

- 1. Outcome of Spotlight Review**
- 2. Spotlight Review Scoping Document**
- 3. Minutes of the Health and Adult Care Scrutiny Committee - 10 September 2020**
- 4. Minutes of the Health and Adult Care Scrutiny Committee – 12 November 2020**

Modernising Health and Care Services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish Area Spotlight Review: Health and Adult Care Scrutiny Committee - 14 December 2020

The Health and Adult Scrutiny Committee carried out a Spotlight Review on 14 December 2020 of the consultation process on the Devon CCG's proposals for *Modernising Health and Care Services in the Dawlish and Teignmouth Areas*. The process has resulted in:

1. a report written by Healthwatch Devon. Their brief was to take the responses of residents from a survey provided by Devon CCG, analyse these responses and report back;
2. the CCG taking account during the engagement process of other possible options besides the one specified in the consultation documentation.

The Review concentrated on the efficacy of the consultation process. Members met with the Healthwatch team to discuss their report and with the CCG to interrogate the process undertaken to consider the other possible options. In view of the short interval before the CCG Governing Body meets on 17 December, members have formulated this brief summary response by deliberating on the following question that addresses a key principle of the engagement process:

As a result of this consultation is there confidence in a credible case for change that both clinicians and residents advocate?

Members accept that Devon CCG provides clear arguments for change. They are strong advocates of an Integrated Care System that prioritises community based intermediate care over rehabilitation beds in community hospitals. Their vision is for GPs working in an environment that includes community-based health services with the voluntary sector offering support alongside. Hence their decision to build a Health Hub in the centre of Teignmouth.

The Healthwatch report gave the patients' perspective on the proposal with a survey that the CCG was heavily involved in determining. There were just over 1,000 responses in an area covering a population of over 35,000 people. The respondents were asked to consider a proposal that would move services from Teignmouth Community Hospital to either the planned new Hub or to Dawlish Community Hospital. The public were also invited to attend online meetings and to put questions to the CCG. It is to be noted that a large proportion of respondents, especially from Teignmouth, raised serious concerns about parking and transport issues both in the survey and online.

Members do not believe that the consultation, from the evidence presented, offers a credible case for change that both clinicians and residents advocate. Co-production is not visible in this consultation and it could not be described as an open collaborative approach. Members cited four examples.

1. The CCG heavily determined the questions for the survey (many of them closed) carried out by Healthwatch.
2. The online meetings were not set up to encourage inter-active conversation on the issues. The technology of Microsoft Teams or Zoom to go into breakout rooms was not utilised.
3. Patient experience does not feature in the evaluation of options process.
4. A key concern of many residents about the merits or demerits of rehabilitation within a hospital or care home setting were not presented. The proposed change is based on the CCG's belief that the quality of services would be maintained and that capacity of community intermediate home-based care is and will continue to be so effective thus making rehabilitation in a hospital setting redundant.

During the scrutiny review members noted that although the CCG has been rolling out this model in other parts of the County, there is no systematic evaluative research co-produced by clinicians, professionals, and service users that presents clear evidence of success (using both quantitative and qualitative methodology) to support this extensive change proposed.

In conclusion, members do not believe that the consultation has convincingly supported the claim that the proposed changes are in the best interests of the health needs of the population in the area.

Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee

Modernising Health and Care Services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish Area

Scoping Document

Chair	Councillor Sara Randall Johnson
Vice Chair	Councillor Hilary Ackland
Membership	Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee
Cabinet Member	Councillor Andrew Leadbetter, Cabinet Member for Adult Social Care and Health Services
Purpose	On 12 November 2020 Health & Adult Care Scrutiny resolved to set up a spotlight review on the modernisation of health and care services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish Area. The Spotlight Review will be a focused scrutiny, concentrating on the efficacy of the consultation process.
Background	<p>The consultation process by Devon CCG has resulted in:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A report written by Healthwatch Devon. Their brief is to take the responses of residents from a survey provided by Devon CCG, analyse these responses and report back. 2. The CCG taking account during the engagement process of other possible options besides the one specified in the consultation documentation.
Terms of Reference	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To evaluate the Healthwatch Report 2. To interrogate the process undertaken to consider the other possible options. 3. To report to NHS Devon Governing Body on the finding of the spotlight review. 4. To report back to the Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee on the findings of the spotlight review.
Task Group schedule	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agree scope and programme • Main spotlight review session • Collate evidence received • Write and agree final report
Possible witnesses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Healthwatch Devon • NHS Devon CCG • South Devon and Torbay Foundation Trust
Potential Questions	<p>In order to evaluate the Healthwatch evaluation members will receive this report at the earliest possible opportunity prior to the review date to have the opportunity to study it. Potential questions to Healthwatch:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Does the report clearly lay out the brief it was given by the CCG? 2. Does the report provide a background to the engagement process and engagement activity to set the responses in context? 3. Is the survey rationale explained with information about its spread, delivery and material produced? Also is it clear that responses received are from a self-selected group and therefore not necessarily representative of the population? 4. Is there a good summary of the data collected including:

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • seeing the data summary related to the questions asked? • showing the demographic information where appropriate? • enabling members to hear the voices of the respondents? <p>5. Is the data analysis process described in sufficient detail to give members confidence in the final analysis?</p> <p>6. Have respondents issues and concerns been highlighted adequately?</p> <p>7. Are the outcome and conclusion credible, confirming the findings?</p>
Background information for Members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The final report of the independent review conducted by Healthwatch. • A report from NHS Devon CCG concerning the evaluation of alternative options. <p>Members will have the opportunity to ask questions of representatives of Healthwatch and the NHS bodies not already covered in the material supporting the consultation.</p>
Timescale	A report will be considered by the NHS Governing Body on 17 December 2020 and Health & Adult Care Scrutiny Committee at its meeting on 26 January 2021.
Contact	<p>Dan Looker Scrutiny Officer t: 01392 382232 e: dan.looker@devon.gov.uk</p>

HEALTH AND ADULT CARE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

10 September 2020

203 Consultation Modernising Health and Care Services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish area

(Councillor J Clatworthy attended in accordance with Standing Order 25 (2) and spoke to this item broadly in support of the proposals noting some local concerns and the effective promulgation of the consultation documents)

The Committee considered the Report of the Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust and NHS Devon Commissioning Group on NHS Devon Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) on its formal public consultation on future services in Teignmouth and Dawlish launched on the 1 September 2020 and to run to 26 October 2020.

The original consultation timeline was designed to enable work to commence in October 2020. However, due to COVID-19, the timescale for the health and wellbeing development had been delayed and the start date had now moved to January 2021. However, the Clinical Commissioning Group remained committed to holding a transparent process and to keeping an open mind. A full copy of the consultation document was appended to the Report.

The Head of Integrated Care at NHS Devon Clinical Commissioning Group, the Director of Transformation and Partnerships (CCG) and Dr Greenwell (local GP) responded to Members' questions relating to:

- the quality and clarity of the consultation material widely distributed in the South Torbay area which was commended by Members and the virtual arrangements as a result of the pandemic;
- financial and other information which was included in the supporting documents listed on the CCG's website and available at: <https://devonccg.nhs.uk/get-involved/currentprojects/health-and-wellbeing-services-in-teignmouth-and-dawlish>;
- the predicted impact on Dawlish and Newton Community Hospitals; and
- the involvement of Devon Healthwatch in independently collating and analysis of the consultation responses for report to the Devon CCG.

Members noted that the full analysis of the consultation outcome for the Clinical Commissioning Group would not be available until after this Committee's next meeting.

It was **MOVED** by Councillor S Randall-Johnson, **SECONDED** by Councillor S Russell and

RESOLVED

- (a) that an update Report from the Clinical Commissioning Group on consultation (with the fullest information available at the time from Devon Healthwatch) be presented to this Committee's next meeting on 12 November 2020; and
- (b) that Members use their role as community leaders to encourage wide engagement in the consultation process in the coastal communities affected.

HEALTH AND ADULT CARE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

12 November 2020

* 214 Modernising Health and Care Services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish area

Councillors J Clatworthy and A Dewhirst attended in accordance with

Standing Order 25 (2) and spoke to this item. Councillor Clatworthy referred to the impending report of Healthwatch and the minimum impact on Dawlish health care services. Councillor Dewhirst referred to local community objections to the proposals (based on a range of issues) and support for the retention of care services at Teignmouth Community Hospital and the role of the Scrutiny Committee within this process.

Councillor Dewhirst also presented a petition of 2783 signatories against the proposals.

The Committee considered the Report of the Devon Clinical Commissioning Group on the progress of the consultation relating to proposals for the reconfiguration of health and care services in Teignmouth and the Dawlish area. The Report followed previous presentations and updates to this Committee.

The formal public consultation on the future delivery of services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish areas had ended on 26 October 2020, with more than 1,000 people having taken part.

Starting on 1 September 2020, the consultation had invited views and comments on a proposal by Devon Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) that arose from plans by Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust (TSDFT) to build a new £8 million Health and Wellbeing Centre in the heart of Teignmouth. This would house Channel View Medical Group, the local health and wellbeing team, Volunteering in Health and possibly one of the existing Teignmouth pharmacies.

The proposal for consultation had consisted of four elements:

- (i) Move the most frequently used community clinics from Teignmouth Community Hospital to the new Health and Wellbeing Centre;
- (ii) Move specialist outpatient clinics, except ear nose and throat clinics, from Teignmouth Community Hospital to Dawlish Community Hospital, four miles away
- (iii) Move day case procedures from Teignmouth Community Hospital to Dawlish Community Hospital; and
- (iv) Continue with a model of community-based intermediate care, reversing the decision to establish 12 rehabilitation beds at Teignmouth Community Hospital

The consultation document had stated that if the proposal was approved, Teignmouth Community Hospital would no longer be needed for NHS services, and it would be likely to be sold by Torbay and South Devon NHS Trust, with the proceeds reinvested in the local NHS.

The Report outlined the consultation process, the role of Healthwatch, and evaluation of alternative options.

The Director for Out of Hospital Commissioning, CCG responded to Members' questions and discussion points included:

- ownership of the Hospital building by the Trust;
- no planning application relating to the new proposed Hub had been submitted at this point;
- due to timing the Healthwatch Report on the results of the consultation had not been completed ready for report to this meeting;
- the process to evaluate the efficacy of the different options prior to the CCG Board meeting 17 December when a decision was expected; and
- the role of this Committee in assessing the outcome of the consultation process and evaluation of proposals.

Members referred to the need for an opportunity to interrogate the evidence in the interests of transparency so the public could have confidence that the consultation was conducted with rigour and fairness before a decision was made by the Clinical Commissioning Group.

It was **MOVED** by Councillor H Ackland, **SECONDED** by Councillor M Asvachin and

RESOLVED that a Spotlight Review be arranged to evaluate the evidence from the final report of Healthwatch and with the benefit of sight of the evaluation process prior to a decision of the Devon Clinical Commissioning Group Governing Body expected at its meeting on 17 December 2020.