

Modernising Health and Care Services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish Area Spotlight Review: Health and Adult Care Scrutiny Committee - 14 December 2020

The Health and Adult Scrutiny Committee carried out a Spotlight Review on 14 December 2020 of the consultation process on the Devon CCG's proposals for *Modernising Health and Care Services in the Dawlish and Teignmouth Areas*. The process has resulted in:

1. a report written by Healthwatch Devon. Their brief was to take the responses of residents from a survey provided by Devon CCG, analyse these responses and report back;
2. the CCG taking account during the engagement process of other possible options besides the one specified in the consultation documentation.

The Review concentrated on the efficacy of the consultation process. Members met with the Healthwatch team to discuss their report and with the CCG to interrogate the process undertaken to consider the other possible options. In view of the short interval before the CCG Governing Body meets on 17 December, members have formulated this brief summary response by deliberating on the following question that addresses a key principle of the engagement process:

As a result of this consultation is there confidence in a credible case for change that both clinicians and residents advocate?

Members accept that Devon CCG provides clear arguments for change. They are strong advocates of an Integrated Care System that prioritises community based intermediate care over rehabilitation beds in community hospitals. Their vision is for GPs working in an environment that includes community-based health services with the voluntary sector offering support alongside. Hence their decision to build a Health Hub in the centre of Teignmouth.

The Healthwatch report gave the patients' perspective on the proposal with a survey that the CCG was heavily involved in determining. There were just over 1,000 responses in an area covering a population of over 35,000 people. The respondents were asked to consider a proposal that would move services from Teignmouth Community Hospital to either the planned new Hub or to Dawlish Community Hospital. The public were also invited to attend online meetings and to put questions to the CCG. It is to be noted that a large proportion of respondents, especially from Teignmouth, raised serious concerns about parking and transport issues both in the survey and online.

Members do not believe that the consultation, from the evidence presented, offers a credible case for change that both clinicians and residents advocate. Co-production is not visible in this consultation and it could not be described as an open collaborative approach. Members cited four examples.

1. The CCG heavily determined the questions for the survey (many of them closed) carried out by Healthwatch.
2. The online meetings were not set up to encourage inter-active conversation on the issues. The technology of Microsoft Teams or Zoom to go into breakout rooms was not utilised.
3. Patient experience does not feature in the evaluation of options process.
4. A key concern of many residents about the merits or demerits of rehabilitation within a hospital or care home setting were not presented. The proposed change is based on the CCG's belief that the quality of services would be maintained and that capacity of community intermediate home-based care is and will continue to be so effective thus making rehabilitation in a hospital setting redundant.

During the scrutiny review members noted that although the CCG has been rolling out this model in other parts of the County, there is no systematic evaluative research co-produced by clinicians, professionals, and service users that presents clear evidence of success (using both quantitative and qualitative methodology) to support this extensive change proposed.

In conclusion, members do not believe that the consultation has convincingly supported the claim that the proposed changes are in the best interests of the health needs of the population in the area.